

Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi

Hacettepe University Journal of Education

e-ISSN: 2536-4758



Migration and Representation of Migration in Turkish High School History Textbooks İsmail Hakkı DEMİRCİOĞLU*

Article Information	ABSTRACT
Received:	Throughout Turkey's geography, migration has been an immutable reality and an essential part of its
29.11.2020	presence. Anatolia, the geography of civilizations shaped by migration, has not only been the destination of
	migration but also the path of migration. It has contributed along with the push and pull factors for migration
Accepted:	movements at different times. The concepts of migration have become more prominent in academic literature,
08.07.2021	especially after the Syrian Civil War outbreak in March 2011. The prerequisite for living in peace with millions
	of refugees, who were supposed to be guests at first, but now seems permanent in our country, is to eliminate
Online First:	xenophobia. Xenophobia can only be combated with an essential humanistic attitude, which politics must
31.10.2023	support. Education is the most important means of achieving this humanistic attitude, and teaching history is
	one of the most appropriate subjects for eliminating xenophobia in education, which can help build a culture
Published:	of coexistence. Therefore, the historicity of migration that is equated equating the historicity of migration with
30.04.2024	the history of humanity and representing migration with an emphasis on the humanistic side of it in history
	textbooks could be constructive ways to combat xenophobia and promote a healthy community life through
	education. The aim of this study is to analyze the level of representation of migration and relevant concepts in
	2018 and 2019 compulsory high school history textbooks published by the MoNE (The Turkish Ministry of
	National Education). Based on this study's findings, it is recommended to improve the quality and quantity of
	the representation of migration and relevant concepts in the history textbooks for the youth to develop a sense
	of empathy with migrants on the threshold of adulthood.
	Keywords: Migration, refugee, history, education, migration in Turkish high school history textbooks
doi: 10.16986/HUJE.2023.	508 Article Type: Research Article

Citation Information: Demircioğlu, İ. H. (2024). Migration and representation of migration in Turkish high school history textbooks. *Hacettepe University Journal of Education*, *39*(2), 238-251. https://doi.org/10.16986/HUJE.2023.508

1. INTRODUCTION

Migration, which is both a way of survival and one of the tools for creating civilizations, is expanded at the point where the world now stands to a common conclusion of the fighting, slaughter, territorial unrest, and even global warming. Turkey is one of the constant stages of migratory movements that gradually make their presence felt in almost every geography. Until a century ago, the migration movements were only concerns of its source, route, and destination but now, especially since the outbreak of Syrian Civil War in 2011, it has turned out to be a reason for global interaction and humanistic crisis. In other words, in assessing the influx of migration worldwide, the representations of those forced to migrate and displaced need to be humanized in law, society, education, and the media alongside an emphasis on the right to survival.

Xenophobia is one of the most important social problems faced by humanity with migration, increasing day by day. One of the prerequisites for the eradication of xenophobia is the integration of migrants into everyday life. Integration into daily life involves public acceptance and a desire to live together with all of the differences. An essential tool in building this humanitarian attitude is education, and the teaching of history has a significant place in structuring awareness and attitudes regarding emigration and immigration. For this reason, representation of migration issues, especially in history textbooks, simultaneously holds the possibility of constructive and destructive views on the subject for high school youth who are about to enter daily life as adults. The degree to which migration is represented in history textbooks plays a vital role in shaping the next generation's view of the Republic of Turkey, which has continued its presence in Anatolia that has experienced migration and served as a transitional geography for other migrations throughout history.

e-ISSN: 2536-4758 http://www.efdergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/

^{*} Prof. Dr., Trabzon University, Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish and Social Sciences Education, Division of Social Sciences Education, Trabzon-TÜRKİYE. e-mail: demircioglu61@yahoo.com (ORCID: 0000-0002-8155-8617)

1.1. The Concept of Migration

The first migration,* which is considered a required method for humanity to build civilizations by going against nature, began with the immigration of human populations to different parts of Europe, North Africa, and Asia by leaving eastern Africa about two million years ago (Harari, 2015), but now there is no explicit consensus on a universal and national scale about what the concept means, what it encompasses, and according to which categories migrants have been classified as migrants/refugees/asylum seekers. The concept is ambiguous at its core, and it is not as easy as it seems to give meaning to the concept of migration, which has evolved throughout history to enable people to withstand harsh natural conditions and adapt by changing location. Erbaş (2010, p. 145) explains the nature of migration as follows: "... it is not as simple as it seems, because the concept of migration is something that does not exist as something objective/material: it is historical, actional; observable, but it does not exist as an objective thing". The International Organization for Migration (IOM, 2019) defines migration as population movements in which a person or a group of people changes place by crossing the international border or internal displacement, regardless of duration, reason, or construction. As can be seen, this term is not entrenched in economic goals and displacement movements to live a more financially comfortable life. In this case, the International Organization for migration tends to interpret people's decisions to migrate broadly.

This general definition of the concept of migration does not contain an explicit consensus on what exactly it encompasses; they are migrants who exclude the migration of lifestyle and migrant lifestyle to the summer resorts of all migrants who want to live a better life by isolating individual or mass mobility for any reason from structure and reason. In another saying, migration, which is a resistance for life in essence (Erbaş, 2018), is a relatively broad term that means more than being a migrant, according to IOM.

Also, the United Nations mainly bases migration on the concept of "migrant" and presents those who migrate in a broad rather than a narrow framework: "migrants are persons who stay in a foreign country for more than one year, whether they migrate involuntarily or not, whether it is a regular or irregular migration." As can be seen, there is no explicit consensus on the terms of migration in the international platform. Moreover, what these terms mean and whom they include is specified by temporal trends. The Turkish legal system also contributes to this terminological ambiguity with terminological complexity.

Several statuses in the Turkish Legal System, such as migrant/conditional refugee/subsidiary protection/temporary protection holder, are due to the geographical limitation to be defended in Geneva Convention, which includes Turkey and is still a primary document on migration concept. As a result of the events that occurred before January 1951, a refugee, according to the Convention, "is someone unable or unwilling to return to their country of origin owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group, or political opinion", thus defining the person who flees Europe to Turkey.** In other words, an asylum seeker who has come to the Republic of Turkey from outside the European Council Countries does not receive a refugee status for whatever reason. Although the number of people seeking asylum in Turkey from Europe was only 28 in 2019 (Erdoğan, 2020, p. 6), over four million Syrian asylum seekers have not been granted refugee status. However, it should be noted that all this terminological chaos arises from the lack of a common consensus on the ambiguity of the concept of migration itself and who exactly it encompasses.

1.2. A Brief History of Migration in Turkey

Anatolian geography has received immigration and emigration in every period and has been used as a migration route. One of the immigration process factors to Anatolia is the Turks who immigrated to this geography from Central Asia and reached Anatolia after a long way and struggle. According to Karpat (2015, p. XXV), the troops of the Peschenegen, Kipchak, and Uzes, as well as Anatolian Turkmens, who participated in the armies of Romanos Diogenes during the Battle of Manzikert, show that the Turks came to Anatolia half a century before the Battle of Manzikert. The Turks were able to dominate Anatolia and conquer other geographies through settlement policies; the continuation, growth, and survival of states have been achieved through migration for hundreds of years. The concept of migration is central not only in the Ottoman Period but also in the Seljuk Period. Along with all nomadic and sedentary life cultures, the emigration of Turks from Central Asia to Anatolia began in the IX. Century and lasted for about 200 years; this process's political product on the Anatolian geography emerged as the establishment of the Anatolian Seljuk state (Özcan, 2005). The Ottoman Empire, founded in the 13th century and shaped by migration waves, officially encouraged migration (Eren & Çakran, 2017, p. 17).

The Ottoman administration supported migration to open the free land for agriculture, increase the Muslim population, raise taxes, defend the borders, and determine the settlement policy accordingly (Yakut, 2015). In the 14th and 15th centuries, there was intense migration of Turks to Anatolia and the Balkans, and sometimes the direction of emigration (since 1352) was from Anatolia to the Balkans (Kayapınar & Ayönü, 2015). As a result of the Alhambra Decree, which published in Spain in 1492, Jews

^{*}The difference between the terms "migration-immigration and emigration" and "migrant, immigrant, emigrant" in English does not exist in Turkish terminologically.

^{**}Retrived from https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/tutanaklar/TUTANAK/KM_/d00/c002/km_00002024ss0053.pdf at Sep. 29, 2020.

who did not convert to Christianity sought refuge in the Ottoman countries with a significant population in order not to be subjected to terrible massacres and torture (Güleryüz, 2015; Kılıç, 2016; Latif, 2002).

Another period of intensive immigration to Anatolia and Ottoman lands was the beginning of the 19th and 20th centuries. Mainly due to the defeats and land losses in the 19th century, significant migration occurred in Anatolia, especially after the Ottoman-Russian war, also known as the "93 Harbi, lit., War of '93", from 1877-1878, a migration policy created due to the decreasing male population in Anatolia (Yazıcı & Demirel, 2006, p. 267) and the wars of 1877-1878, about 1.5 million immigrants fled to Ottoman lands. (Karpat, 2003 p. 114). Another critical wave of migration to Anatolia occurred after the 1912 Balkan War, and 413,922 people found refuge in Anatolian countries between 1912-1920 (Directorate General of Migration Management, 2020). Immigration to Anatolia continued long after the establishment of the Turkish Republic. According to the Convention on Population Exchange between Greece and Turkey, people migrated from Turkey to Greece and from Greece to Turkey (Ağanoğlu, 1999, p. 32). Also, in the first years of the Turkish Republic, many Crimean and Noghais people fled to Anatolian areas between 1922 and 1938 (Yakut, 2015).

Turkey maintains its characteristics as a migration center of the world until today. As a result of the civil war and intervention in Syria, some Syrian citizens have immigrated to Turkey or have started to use Turkey as a transit route to Europe. According to the current official statistics from United Nations, there are only 3.6 million registered Syrians and about 330,000 asylum seekers of other nationalities in Turkey (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, UNHCR, 2020).

1.3. Migration and Education

e-ISSN: 2536-4758

Migration has become a reality in the geography in which we live and in the world. The fact that one out of every three living children is a refugee child who has to live outside their country of birth, and that the number of refugee children in the world doubled in the decennium between 2005-2015 shows that migration is coming into possession of a universal reality (UNICEF, 2018). Turkey, in its chaotic geography beyond the borders of the countries colonized by the imperialist states, is a constant arena of migration and it seems to have this specialty for many years. Providing the integration that depends on migration seems possible at first with the empathy to be developed towards immigrants on an individual basis and en masse. After all, migration is Turkey's reality, and this reality should widely apply in everyday practice. One of the essential and possibly the most important tool is education, which is above things and a universal human right (European Court of Human Rights, ECHR, Art. 2). Therefore, migration issues should occur in the education and training process, and teaching materials should be used in this process. The inclusion of migration issues and concepts in educational processes and materials is a significant constructive factor for the enrichment of all people who are currently living together or will live together in the future by sharing the life and making contributions to common culture without discrimination, marginalization, and xenophobia.

Although Syrian refugees were welcomed as guests with the open-door policy that our country implemented after the upsurge of the Syrian Civil War on March 15, 2011, the intervening years show that it can go far beyond being guests. (Gencer, 2017, p. 841). At the beginning of the process, an Arabic curriculum was provided to the Syrian children who were expected to return, which pushed the Turkish language to the background, but due to the ever-increasing number of immigrants, a permanent solution was sought (Gencer, 2017, p. 841). In 2013, the Turkish Ministry of National Education (MoNE) took unprecedented steps regarding migration and education. Project on Promoting Integration of Syrian Kids into the Turkish Education System (PIKTES) is a European Union project funded with 500 million euros and implemented jointly by the Ministry of Family and Social Policies of the Republic of Turkey, UNICEF, and Turkish Red Crescent is remarkable and contributes to the enrollment rate of Syrian immigrant children (SETA & Theirworld, 2017) and the enrollment rate of Syrian children reached 63.23% as of today (MoNE, 2018). In 2016, 193 member states of the United Nations signed the New York Declaration for Refugees and Immigrants. Thus, the general framework related to education policies non-binding of immigrant children in the areas of education, health, and psychosocial development of migrant children.

The problem of children's access to education requires state policies implemented on a macro scale. Besides, the education content that children can access is important for both immigrant and nonimmigrant children. The quality of the presentation of migration, migrants and other concepts related to migration in the content of the teaching materials and textbooks used in the education system; It has a humanitarian side to immigrant children and is vital for raising awareness and developing a sense of empathy for non-immigrant children. Therefore, the presentation of migration-related concepts in textbook contents can create social awareness. The content of the curriculum, on the other hand, has been prepared based on "General Objectives of Turkish National Education" and "Basic Principles of Turkish National Education" included in Article 2 of the National Education Basic Law no.1739, and its root values are "justice, friendship, honesty, self-control, patience, respect, love, responsibility, patriotism, benevolence".

It is undeniable that the concept subject of migration is associated with all these values. Within the history curriculum, the presentation of migration for 9th and 10th grade is generally aimed under the title "Turkish migrations to Anatolia" and the subtitles "Migration in ancient times," "Migration of tribes," " Aegean Migration" and " Nomadic Migration" and " Settled Lifestyle"; in the 11th-grade curriculum, the concepts of "rural-urban migration" have been added to these. Thus, the concept of migration has been mentioned 12 times in the syllabus, and nomadism has found a place six times. Nomadism on migration

and relevant other concepts forms are 50% of the concept of migration. This shows that the concept of migration is represented with macro qualities over the concept of nomadism, which can now be considered out of date.

There are insufficient studies on the concepts related to migration in the textbooks in our country, and there is no study on how the concept is presented in history textbooks. Studies on the representation of the concepts of migration in geography, Turkish and social studies textbooks have identified similar deficiencies in representing the concept of migration and reached parallel results. When the researches on the presentation of migration in textbook contents are examined, the following conclusions have been reached:

How the concept of migration is represented in 9th, 10th, 11th, and 12th-grade geography textbooks, all of which are published by the Ministry of National Education (Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, MoNE, abbr. in En., MoNE), was investigated in the study of Sezer and Şanlı (2017); on the phenomenon of migration in geography textbooks, four geography textbooks prepared according to the Geography Course Program of 2015, which was revised in 2011 by the publications of the Ministry of National Education, were analyzed. At the end of the study, it was found that the term "migration" was misused and that the textbooks did not include current migrations and did not mention the consequences experienced by individuals and societies after migration. Besides, it is pointed out that in the contents of the analyzed geography textbooks Migration Legislation and "refugee issue," "deportation," "migration policy," "human trafficking," "asylum", such terms were not given a place.

Sezer and İnesi (2016) evaluated the representation of migration and other relevant concepts in secondary school social studies textbooks published by three private publishers, two of them by the Ministry of Education Publications. In this study, it was found that the humanistic side of migration was incompletely explained, terms such as "labor migration," "temporary migration," "brain drain," "seasonal migration" were never mentioned; that the socio-economic dimensions of migration were not mentioned in the MoNE (National Education) books, instead, unfashionable terms such as summer pasture, nomad, winter quarter were preferred (Sezer & İnesi, 2016, p. 3275). These findings were also confirmed by the studies of Taşkın and Memişoğlu (2019, p. 607), in which they examined nine social studies books based on the inclusion of contemporary topics, and it was pointed out that the quality of presenting relevant concepts needs to be increased.

Esendemir and Ertaş (2018) examined the presence of the concept of migration in Turkish language textbooks, four of which were published by the Ministry of National Education Publications and three by the private publisher. In this study, 219 texts were scrutinized, and only eight elements regarding migration were confirmed in the contents (Esendemir & Ertaş, 2018, p. 79). Nevertheless, Turkish language teaching has a significant value in understanding the humanistic side of migration and raising children's awareness. As in other studies, it was found that terms such as "refugee," "asylum", "asylum seeker", or "displaced" had a smaller scope in the study than expected (Esendemir & Ertaş, 2018). Yeniçeri (2011) was able to locate only one text in Turkish 5th, 6th, 7th, and 8th-grade textbooks published by four private publishers that directly dealt with migration.

Consequently, there are studies in the Turkish literature, which support each other on the topic of poor representation of the concept of migration, refugee, and other concepts in textbook content, and it is also seen that there is no adequate academic study on this topic in the same field.

2. METHODOLOGY

This study aims to reveal the representation level of the concepts related to migration and other concepts in the Turkish compulsory high school history textbooks published by the Turkish Ministry of National Education in 2018 and 2019. In this framework, taking into account the period included in the textbooks, an assessment was made based on the concepts of "migration" (göç*), "migrant" (göçmen), "refugee" (mülteci), "asylum" (iltica), "asylum seeker" (sığınmacı), "nomad" (konargöçer), and "unsettled" (göçebe). In this study, based on the examination of documents, a quantitative-qualitative approach was adopted. In this research, the quantitative and qualitative dimensions include content analysis and descriptive analysis relatively. Determining the frequency of reoccurrence of migration concepts and themes constitutes the quantitative dimension of the study. In determining the frequency of recurrence of keywords, index, questions/points, debate, themes, diagrams, and references are excluded, so only the forms as used in the content were considered. The qualitative dimension of the study involves giving meaning to the presentation of the concepts and themes in the textbooks under study, and the descriptive analysis is done by using the same quotations from the particular textbook in which the concept of migration is explained.

Document analysis is an approach based on the principle of studying visual and textual materials such as course books, newspapers, a political novel, pictures, advertisements, etc. (Frankel & Wallen, 2009). This approach has two main objectives: The first is to show how frequently words, phrases, and themes are repeated in texts and pictures. The second goal is to looking at the meaning in the texts and images. In other words, document analysis is based on quantitative and qualitative analysis of documents both (Bloor & Fiona, 2006). This approach is preferred to characterize both the quantitative data of migration, and

^{*}It should be noted again that the terminological equivalents of "migration-immigration-emigration" and "migrant-immigrant-emigrant" concepts in Turkish do not differ as in English. For this reason, the term "migration" means $g\ddot{o}\varsigma$; the term of "immigrant" has been chosen for the " $g\ddot{o}\varsigma$ men" concept.

relevant concepts, and the qualitative representation of these concepts. This is because, despite the quantitative presentation of the findings, the tables allow for a qualitative judgment about the individuals concerned. (Koçak & Arun, 2006, p. 24).

The research sample consists of the compulsory high school history textbooks published in 2018 and 2019 by the Turkish Ministry of National Education. The reason why only the history books prepared by the state for high school students were selected in the study is to evaluate the official perspective on the concept of migration. The mentioned books can be accessed from the website shown in the bibliography or from many open sources on the internet. The textbooks examined in this study are shown in the following table.

3. FINDINGS

3.1. Findings Regarding the 9th Grade Turkish High School History Textbooks

The textbooks of the 9th grade give information in the first chapters about the basic concepts of the science of history and the early periods in which mankind appeared on earth. There are six chapters in each of the 9th-grade history textbooks of which 2018 and 2019 editions are by the same authors and have the same content. These chapters are: "History and Time", "Early Ages of Mankind", "The World in Medieval Ages", "The Turkish World in the First and Middle Ages", "The Birth of Islamic Civilization", "The Adoption of Islam by the Turks and the Early Turkish Islamic States". It can be seen that the concept of migration in the 9th-grade history textbooks is mainly centered under the titles of "Early Humanity" and "The Turkish World in the First and Middle Ages". In the 9th-grade history textbooks examined in this study, the following section presents the level of representation of the concepts on migration represented as a whole:

Table 2. 9th Compulsory Turkish High School History Textbook MoNE Publication 2018a, 2019a

Concept	f
Migration	26
Migrant	-
Asylum	-
Refugee	2
Asylum Seeker	1
Nomad	41
Unsettled	9

The textbook's quantitative presentation of the concept of migration and migration-related terms, as indicated in the table above, focuses on the capacity to shape societies and history rather than on individual migration. The title "The Subject of History" in the book's introduction indicates that the book is written from the point of view that all events and facts that can shape migration and the subject of history are individual but predominantly social.

The subject of history is a work of human activity on the earth over time, the changes result from various effects and are shown to be the result of human action. Besides, natural events are involved in history as they affect humans in their consequences. For example, the drought and famine in Central Asia are not the history subjects, but the migrations resulting from this natural event can be the subject of history. (MoNE, 2018a, p. 14; 2019a, p. 14).

Migration was referred to in the book's contents as mass mobilities and occurred primarily for reasons of climate, drought, and war, as the "geographical mobility of communities." In another saying, migration is presented in parallel with the containing themes as it used to be part of the world order, which was independent of the concepts such as border, passport, residence, or work permit of the nation-states that emerged from the 1789 French Revolution, and it is presented almost entirely in this way.

From the past to the present, people have striven to find new places by leaving the settlements where they live for compelling reasons or attain desired living conditions. These migratory movements, which can be observed in every era of history, have profoundly influenced the course of human history. The realization causes of migrations that follow an increasing or decreasing navigation overtime vary widely. Developments such as difficulties to settlement and climate changes, political changes, oppression of faith groups; generate the political, economic, religious, and geographical reasons of migration (Mone, 2018a, p. 44; 2019a, p. 44).

Turkish migrations observed in the three major continents of the old world are based on severe causes. Researchers who study migration have found that since leaving the country where they live forever is an extreme hardship for people, no tribe was spontaneously and arbitrarily replaced. Migrations were found to occur only due to force majeure (MoNE, 2018a, p. 108; 2019a, p. 108).

Table 1. 9th, 10th, 11th, 12th Turkish High School History Textbooks, Which Reviewed Within the Scope of the Research

Grade Level and Subject	9 th Grade High School History Textbook	9 th Grade High School History Textbook	10 th Grade High School History Textbook	10 th Grade High School History Textbook	11 th Grade High School History Textbook	11 th Grade High School History Textbook	12 th Grade T.R. History of Revolution and Kemalism
Authors	Assist Prof. Dr. Erol YÜKSEL Assist Prof. Dr Mehmet Ali KAPAR Ferhat BİLDİK Kazım ŞAHİN Leyla ŞAFAK Murat ARDIÇ Özgür BAĞCI Süleyman YILDIZ	Assist Prof. Dr. Erol YÜKSEL Assist Prof. Dr. Mehmet Ali KAPAR Ferhat BİLDİK Kazım ŞAHİN Leyla ŞAFAK Murat ARDIÇ Özgür BAĞCI Süleyman YILDIZ	Assist Prof. Dr. Erol YÜKSEL Assist Prof. Dr. Mehmet Ali KAPAR Ferhat BİLDİK Kazım ŞAHİN Leyla ŞAFAK Murat ARDIÇ Özgür BAĞCI Süleyman YILDIZ	Assist Prof. Dr. Erol YÜKSEL Assist Prof. Dr. Mehmet Ali KAPAR Ferhat BİLDİK Kazım ŞAHİN Leyla ŞAFAK Murat ARDIÇ Özgür BAĞCI Süleyman YILDIZ	Ali LAÇİN Bedrihan ÖNAL Bülent DEMİR Erdal ERDEM Mikail KAPLAN Murat ARICA Salih GÜNDOĞDU Veli AYDEMİR Yahya KARAKAYA Yusuf ÇAKMAK	Assist Prof. Dr. Erol YÜKSEL Assist Prof. Dr. Mehmet Ali KAPAR Ferhat BİLDİK Kazım ŞAHİN Leyla ŞAFAK Murat ARDIÇ Süleyman YILDIZ Yasemin ARDIÇ	Akif ÇEVİK Gül KOÇ Koray ŞERBETÇİ
Publisher** and Year	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing), Ankara, 2018	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing) Ankara, 2019	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing) Ankara, 2018.	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing) Ankara, 2019	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing) Ankara, 2018.	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing), Ankara, 2019.	MoNE Devlet Kitapları (MoNE National Publishing) Ankara, 2019.

e-ISSN: 2536-4758

^{*}Turkish Republic Ministry of National Education State Library

Since the 9th-grade textbook starts chronologically from the earliest times in history, it is understandable that migration is presented with the quality of shaping history rather than our present. After all, the book covers the time when civilizations are established, and people struggle for shelter and food to survive, not the forced contemporary migration that results from political chaos in a world where the nation-state's borders are drawn. Another point worth noting is the use of the terms "nomad" and "unsettled", which are semantically very close. Turkish Language Association describes "unsettled" as "not settled (a person or a community), nomadic, moving with tents, animals and other means within a given region depending on various conditions". Defining the term "nomad" with the term "unsettled" but using these two terms as if they have different meanings indicates terminological confusion. Sezer and Şanlı (2016, p. 24) also noted that the term "nomadic" is misused in geography books.

The term "refugee" was used twice in the textbook content and the first time in the account of the Margus Treaty of 434. "Refugees who are detained in Byzantium are brought back." Also would be able to give a ransom to those of Greek origin (MoNE, 2018a, p. 115; 2019a, p. 115)." It would be appropriate to use the term "migration" rather than "asylum" to describe these mobilities, which long predate nation-states, i.e., national borders, passports, national identity, residence/asylum/work permits. The definition of "refugee" in the dictionary at the end of the book is as follows: A person who has sought refuge in another country or place; asylum seeker (MoNE, 2018a, p. 210). The term 'asylum seeker' was tused once in the context of the refugee concept. The legal status of an asylum seeker and a refugee, on the other hand, is different, and being an asylum seeker corresponds to a status that is in limbo. In other words, the term "refugee" has been used differently from its definition, which is anchored in migration terminology, and confusion has been created between the terms "migration" (action) and "migrant" (subject).

It should be noted that in the account of migration, which is generally emphasized under the concept of nomadism and its historical nature, the impact of the concept of migration on the provisions of the law is also enshrined with an emphasis on the positive and general effects of migration: Throughout history, people have developed the rules of law as well as the great wars, the great migrations, the differentiation of their social structures and the advancement of their stages of development (MoNE, 2018a, p. 85; 2019a, p. 85).

To sum up, the 9th-grade history textbook taught Turks' migratory movements in general, especially nomadism and tribal migration. Although migration movements, with their changing aspects over the centuries, have different qualifications, it was evaluated that it is more appropriate to approach the concept instead of the event. Alternatively, migration characterized as a "social event" was treated with the following narrative, which is insufficient to describe the concept's components: Migration as a social event means that a community leaves its home for various reasons and moves or relocates another place. Communities do not leave their country without good reason and embark on an unpredictable adventure. This is because the lands they are heading towards are not empty or deserted. Therefore, migrating communities are forced to struggle for dominance against the people or communities in the places to which they move. And consequently, the migrating community must either dominate the people in the geography to which they have migrated or displace them elsewhere (MoNE, 2018a, p. 113; 2019a, p. 113).

To describe migration as a "social event" rather than a fact is to ignore the movement of cause-effect relationship that has existed for centuries. To view migration movements not based on "events" but as movement qua causes and effects makes it more convenient to raise awareness of mass mobilities that can be built through textbooks.

9th-grade history textbook in which the same content is presented in both years of publication; it covers the period before the nation-state, not current migrations from the period included in it. Therefore, it is ubiquitous to have a narrative based on nomadism rather than concepts such as refugee, asylum seeker, and asylum. This is also a period in which migratory mobilities were expressed not in a micro dimension but in a macro dimension capable of shaping history.

3.2. Findings Regarding the 10th Grade Turkish High School History Textbooks

The 10th-grade history textbook covers topics related to the Turks' presence from the Seljuks to the Ottomans in Anatolia, especially up to the classical period of Anatolian Seljuk and the Ottoman Empire. Each of the 10th-grade history textbooks, whose 2018 and 2019 editions are by the same authors and have the same content, consists of seven chapters. These chapters are; Seljuk Turkey in the process of settlement and stratification, Ottoman Politics from principality to state (1302-1453), fighters and soldiers during stratification, Ottoman Civilization from principality to state, Ottomans as a superpower (1453-1595), the Sultan and the classical Ottoman social order in Classical Age with the Sultan and Ottoman Central Organization. The frequency of occurrence of migration and concepts regarding migration observed in all chapters of the content of the 10th-grade history textbook is tabulated below:

The content representation of migration in the 10th-grade history textbook has been given macro character formative communities and history following the 9th-grade content. The emphasis that "the political and religious causes shape migration, their influence on the shaping of law" in the 9th-grade history textbook has been used to illustrate migration as the historical mobility that shapes the present, primarily based on the Turkish migrations. The demography-changing nature of migration and its influence on the Turkic states' foundation has been presented, especially in the Oghuz, Turkmen, and Mongolian Migrations case.

e-ISSN: 2536-4758 http://www.efdergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/

Table 3. 10th Grade History Textbook, MoNE Publication, 2018, 2019

Concept	f	
Migration	17	
Migrant	3	
Asylum	-	
Refugee	-	
Asylum Seeker	-	
Nomad	8	
Unsettled	2	

Oghuz migrations increasingly continued, and accordingly, the Turkification of Anatolia accelerated. The Turkification of Anatolia is a significant fact in world history. Before the Turks conquered, Anatolia became a battlefield due to the Byzantine-Sassanid and Byzantine-Arab naval battles, and the population in the region declined. After the Turks gained dominion over Anatolia, there was a mass exodus of Turkmen to the area, and this population formed the Turkic majority in the ethnic group of the area. Moreover, they had to retreat to the territorial enclave in the Crusades' aftermath, although the Turks in Anatolia had the opportunity to advance to the coast of Western Anatolian (Mone, 2018a, p. 50; 2019b, p. 50).

The subject of this book is the Settlement Policy, that is, the transformation of migration concepts and migrants into a population policy in the Ottoman Empire, and has been described as follows:

Oghuz migrations increasingly continued, and accordingly, the Turkification of Anatolia accelerated. The Turkification of Anatolia is a significant fact in world history. Before the Turks conquered, Anatolia became a battlefield due to the Byzantine-Sassanid and Byzantine-Arab naval battles, and the population in the region declined. After the Turks gained dominion over Anatolia, there was a mass exodus of Turkmen to the area. This population formed the Turkic majority in the ethnic group of the area. Moreover, they had to retreat to the territorial enclave in the Crusades' aftermath. However, the Turks in Anatolia had the opportunity to advance to Western Anatolian's coast (Mone, 2018a: 50, 2019b: 50).

Although this narrative of the Settlement Policy emphasizes that the migrant population should not be reduced to the "settlement" of the migrant population, it does not sufficiently mention the gains made with the integration of migrants. However, resettling migrants in the country with settlement policies and subsequent integration are concrete examples to understand migration's positive effects as Ottoman Empire has done. Settlement policy is essentially a model for integrating migrants, and in this respect, its presentation points to an essential issue in the presentation of the concept of migration.

Another point that stands out in this book is that, unlike the 9th-grade history textbook, the term "migrant" has found its place three times. One of these contents is given under the consequences of the macro effect of migration. In essence, it is far from emphasizing the universal tragedy of the concept of migration.

XVII. A group of these Arab migrants, which existed until the beginning of the century and was known as Mubtecel, was placed in Galata around Arab Mosque (MoNE, 2018b, p. 155; 2019b, p. 155).

I am the Sultan of the Conquerors, and I declare to the whole world that the Bosnian Franciscans, who have been provided with this Sultan's Decree, are under my protection and command: No one shall disturb or harm the people mentioned above and their churches. Those who live in peace in my state and those who become migrants shall live in freedom and security (MoNE, 2018, p.: 206; 2019b, p. 206).

The phrase used by Mehmet the Conqueror in his pact (Ahdname), when evaluated under the conditions of the time, is not semantically negative, but on the contrary, evokes a positive meaning. Emphasizing the importance of the emperor's guarantee of the required tolerance towards the minorities could have had a significant impact on the formation of consciousness, but this issue was not sufficiently addressed. This is because the above narrative draws attention to the fact that migration status is a contemporary tragedy and the disadvantaged position of migrants throughout history, and it has the potential to contribute more to raising awareness towards migrants.

The terms 'asylum seeker', 'asylum', and 'refugee' have not been covered in 10^{th} grade textbooks, although it should be noted that this book's content includes the period before the emergence of nation-states. The perception of macro migration, described by the terms nomad and nomadic, is common in this book with the same limitations.

3.3. Findings Regarding the 11th Grade Turkish High School History Textbooks

The topics covered in the 11th-grade history textbook focus on the post-classical period Ottoman Empire and relationships. The 2018 11th grade history textbook was revised in 2019 by different authors. However, both books consist of six identical units,

e-ISSN: 2536-4758 http://www.efdergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/

and those units are; Ottoman Politics in Changing World Balances (1595-1774), Europe and the Ottoman in the Age of Change, Balance Strategy in International Relations (1774-1914), Changing State-Society Relations in the Age of Revolutions, Capital and Labor, and XIX and XX. It is the Changing Daily Life in XIX. And XX century. The frequency of migration terms mentioned in the 2018 11th grade history textbook is tabulated below:

Table 4. 11th Grade History Textbook, MoNE Publication, 2018

Concept	f
Migration	32
Migrant	6
Asylum	-
Refugee	-
Asylum Seeker	-
Nomad	-
Unsettled	-

It should be noted that the textbook in which the definition of the concept of migration is most intense among high school history textbooks is the 11th-grade history textbook in both years of publication. In this textbook, unlike previous textbooks, migration is described not only as an effect or a concept that shapes history with societies but also as a "cause." These causes include mechanization (MoNE, 2018c, p. 63), landlessness (MoNE, 2018c, p. 65), rebellions and political chaos (MoNE, 2018c, pp. 74-109), merchant capitalism (MoNE, 2018c, p. 137), imperialist state policies (MoNE, 2018c, p. 189), independence and nationalism (MoNE, 2018c, p. 201), and industrialization (MoNE, 2018c, p. 144; pp. 205-206). Migration outcomes are generally presented as internal migration from village to city.

Although the concept of the nation-state is included in the timeline of the book (MoNE, 2018c, pp. 146-147), even in the 11th-grade textbook where the concept of migration is covered intensively, the distinction of migration-asylum, migrant-refugee/asylum seeker is not made, and the terms asylum/refugee/asylum seeker are not included. The book's content does not include the terms 'nomad' and 'unsettled', which have been covered extensively in previous grade books. Also, it is worth noting that migrants are treated as people who need to be sent away from their habitat, which leads to some problems and even chaos.

The 11th-grade history textbook has been revised in the 2019 edition with different authors but with the same units. In this revised book, it has been observed that there is a significant quantitative improvement in the presentation of the concept of migration as compared to the 11th-grade history textbook in 2019.

Table 5. 11th Grade History Textbook, MoNE Publications, 2019

Concept	f
Migration	50
Migrant	15
Asylum	-
Refugee	2
Asylum Seeker	-
Nomad	-
Unsettled	1

In the 2019 edition, the 2018 migration concept and units' presentation frequency has been kept unchanged. The concept of "refugee" which had no place in the previous edition itself, has been included in the textual content. However, this concept was described in the "Refugee Crises" that occurred when Poles who found asylum in the Ottoman Empire in 1849 were asked by Austria and Russia to be taken back from the Ottoman Empire. Then the Ottoman Empire denied their request (2019c, p. 126) narrating migration with a status based on national identities after the emergence of nation-states was interpreted as an "evolution" in light of the previous issue.

Moreover, it was seen as a shortcoming not to mention their micro-level impact when narrating migration and other relevant concepts, but to consider their macro-level impact and make visible their part in shaping history and society. However, the book historically covers the period of Balkan migrations in the 1800s with nation-states. These migrations and the change in demographics in the Ottoman Empire are also the mobilities in which great tragedies were experienced on the human level. In the narrative of migration, emphasizing the historical tragedy of displacement may have the potential to raise awareness of contemporary migration and any historical displacement through tragedy spread across time.

3.4. Findings Regarding the 12th Grade Turkish Revolution History and Kemalism Coursebooks

The 12th Grade Turkish Revolution History and Kemalism Coursebook deals with the emerging developments in the transition from the Ottoman state to the Modern Turkish Republic, particularly the political events in Turkey in the last century. There are eight units in each of the 12th-grade history textbooks, the 2018 and 2019 editions of which are by the same authors and have the same content. These units are as follows; The Ottoman State and the World in the First Half of the 20th Century, National Struggle, Kemalism and Turkish Revolution, Turkey and the World in the Interwar Period, Turkey and the World during the World War II, Turkey, and the World after the World War II, The World and Turkey in the Age of Social Revolution, Turkey and the World: on the Brink of XXI. Century. The above units in the 12th Grade Revolution History and Kemalism Coursebook have been kept unchanged in content in the 2019 edition with the same authors. The quantitative and qualitative data obtained from the book content are tabulated as follows:

Table 6. 12th Grade Turkish Revolution History and Kemalism Coursebook, Educational Publication (MoNE), Undated.

Concept	f
Migration	66
Migrant	3
Asylum	1
Refugee	18
Asylum Seeker	3
Nomad	-
Unsettled	-

e-ISSN: 2536-4758

When examining the book's content, it was found that migration was presented in two parts; before and after 1945. In the period between 1881 and 1945, migration was presented as a necessity of displacement in the conditions of war and as a method of survival effort, but in the content, it appeared to shape social and cultural life, which was updated with internal migration after 1945.

Due to the reasons such as the beginning of mechanization in agriculture; with the growth of population in the family; decreasing lands due to the individuals who form the family divide the inheritance among; with much more employment opportunities being offered in the cities compared to the villages, people immigrated to the cities. Large cities such as Ankara, İstanbul, Adana, Izmir received many migrants (MoNE, 2018a; 2018b, p. 179).

Migrations were presented, especially in the case of internal migration from the 1950s onwards, in the context of push and pull factors, focusing on the economy and highlighting the problems it caused. The factors that caused migration were presented as follows: Rapid population growth, loss of land, scarce land to support the crowding population in the villages, reduction in the need for rural labor due to the development of the methods of modern agriculture, the demands of people living in the villages to benefit from improved education, health, and public services in the cities and the facilitation of the movement of rural people to the cities through the development of the transport network. As a result, economic and political problems have been highlighted in places where migratory mobility is experienced (MoNE, 2018a; 2018b, p. 216). The narrative of post-1945 migration highlights: the abandonment of farmland due to internal migration, the decline in agricultural production, livestock being left behind, the occurrence of pollution, squatting, urban sprawl as a result of excessive population growth in major cities, the rise in crime rates as a result of inadequate health, education, and infrastructure services.

The narrative of migration, which was presented in the new edition of the 11th-grade history book using current terms, was also continued in this book, and in parallel, the terms "refugee (mülteci)" and "asylum seeker (sığınmacı)" became visible instead of the terms nomad (konargöçer) or unsettled (göçebe). The term "migrant" was used three times, and all three terms were involved in describing the social activities in the period of National Struggle. In essence, the content of the migrant concept as a status and the narrative of whom it can encompass is crucial to understanding the time zone in the book because in our country, "migrant" is "associated with the descendants of Turkish and Turkic culture who come to Turkey alone or in masses to settle, who are accepted according to this law"(Resettlement Law, Art.3/d). In other words, the term migrant presupposes "Turkish descent" as a status, following the third article of Settlement Law and the narrative in the book content. The term "refugee" is used 18 times in the content of the book, but its definition is given as equivalent to the term "asylum seeker" (2019d, p. 260). It can be observed that the other two representations of the concept of refugee are also intertwined with the concept of refugee. However, the terms refugee and asylum seeker are terminologically completely different and correspond to different statuses in terms of content and law. The terminological confusion in the law has been incorporated into the content of the book through terminological errors.

It can be said that the negative meaning prevails in the narrative of the refugee concept. To illustrate the refugee problem (MoNE, 2018a, p. 169; p. 253; 2018b; p. 169; p. 253), refugee issue (MoNE, 2018a, p. 170; 2018b, p. 170), descent into a refugee status (MoNE, 2018a; 2018b, p. 244), becoming a refugee (MoNE, 2018a, p. 246; 2018b, p. 246), taking in the refugee (MoNE, 2018a, p. 252; 2018b, p. 252): these narratives are interpreted as approaching all refugees, who are in a disadvantaged position

anyway, with an exclusionary way of speaking, instead of enabling students to build empathy towards refugees and creating awareness for students.

The textbook on the history of revolution and Kemalism for 12th grade, which was not revised between the two editions, was presented with a narrative-like up-to-date characteristic of the concept of migration. However, it is still lacking at the point of making the human side of migration visible. The concept was offered in two different concepts with the time intervals of 1881-1945 and 1945-present; in the first interval, harsh conditions in the state of emergency were emphasized, but this presentation referred to its macro dimension. During National Struggle and then World War I, its micro dimension was ignored at the point of escape, survival, the right to life. In other words, the tragedy on a human scale was not considered. The destructive effects of internal migration from the 1945s onwards in social and economic life have been expressed in this study's concluding section and Push-Pull Theory's core. Not mentioning the national policy that triggers internal migration in Turkey is a shortcoming where migration is described.

Terminological confusion and terminological errors also exist in the content of the 12th grade book. The presentation of the concept with the emphasis on the human tragedy of displacement through the correct use of the terms refugee, migrant, and asylum seeker as a legal status should be seen as a positive and even necessary improvement in raising awareness about migration.

4. RESULTS, DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Migration is a meaningful and historical reality for humanity, without distinction of any time zone or geography. The civilization that has evolved with migration seems to limit the same migration concept within states' political goals and interests today. Nowadays, mobilities of individuals or masses have fundamentally risen to tragedies of political or economic nature. In this case, all migration concepts that can be detailed under these two terms should be one of the main titles of national and international consciousness that must be created. Individuals or masses not being migrants/refugees/asylum seekers from the past to the present does not mean that they will not be in the near or distant future, nor does it mean that they will not receive migrants/refugees/asylum seekers permanently or temporarily. In this context, the existence of a significant concept such as migration should be seen as a return of educational policy and duty of conscience.

Moreover, history textbooks hold the potential to have the most capable content to create empathy-based awareness. For this reason, the representation of migration in history textbooks is closely related to conscience, the culture of coexistence, and even the continuity of national politics, because migration is history itself. In this context, 9th, 10th, 11th, and 12th-grade history textbooks, all published by the Ministry National Education and taught in history classes, were examined through descriptive analysis using the terms "migration", "migrant", "asylum", "refugee" and "asylum seeker". The term "migration," which was used 26 times in the 9th-grade history textbook, dropped to 17 in the 10th-grade textbook; it increased to 32 in the first edition of the 11th-grade history textbook and again to 50 in the 2019 edition of the 11th-grade history textbook. In other words, the 2019 revised edition of the 11th-grade history textbook made the term migration much more visible in quantitative terms. In the 12th-grade history textbook, which covers the more current period, migration has found a place 66 times by being taught intensively both quantitatively and qualitatively.

In addition to this quantitative data, when looking at the qualitative account of migration, it is evaluated that the books are based on the macro quality of the concept of migration, and the humanitarian and tragic side of migration is ignored. When considering the time zone covered by the teaching content, this situation is normal for the 9th and 10th grades; it has become a deficit in the 11th and 12th-grade textbooks. Undoubtedly, with the 11th and 12th-grade textbooks, the impact of migration on culture rather than on communities and states has been visible. However, at the point of building empathy and creating awareness, it has remained incapable on the conceptual basis. Even the mentioned visibility has no style and content that enable young people to develop empathy to understand the "other" or "stranger" and accept coexistence. If we disregard migrations for economic reasons, the emphasis on a universal tragedy in the representation of migration that evolves into a concept of asylum is a sine qua non, especially in the case of nation-states after 1789- French Revolution 1789 and the "migrant" concept that evolves into a refugee concept. This emphasis, capable of generating empathy, is found lacking in the book's curriculum and content. A must is the emphasis of the migration concept on its characteristics, its effects on human life, and the evolution to asylum these days alongside the emphasis on its macro effects through deep processing; and to ensure that the youth approach this tragic movement of individuals forced to migrate with empathy. Nonetheless, in this situation, the concepts of "justice, friendship, righteousness, self-control, patience, respect, sympathy, responsibility, patriotism, humanism" - presented as "root values" in the history education curriculum - will come to the fore. For in a country where the displaced have to seek asylum, integration, which is to be achieved by the growing generation developing empathy and creating awareness, should be identified as a goal in which all these root values can be re-embedded without exception.

The concept of migration in history textbooks reviewed with an overall assessment was given with the -not current- nature of shaping communities throughout history. It was created in the Push-Pull Theory framework, whose theoretical basis is insufficient for the meaning of forced migration movements. In contrast, elaborating the books' theoretical framework based on current theories is better suited to emphasize the humanitarian aspect of migration. The more current humanitarian predicaments of the concept, such as asylum and refugee, which have taken on a new dimension with the 1789 French

Revolution, have been ignored. However, the concept has gained intensity, especially in the 11th and 12th-grade curricula. It has been taught based on rural-urban migration; its micro-based nature alienated by the treatment of its macro effects. Even in its micro representation on the human scale, the outmoded terms nomad and unsettled concepts are striking. In textbooks, while the humanitarian tragedy and personal effects of the migration concept are usually left out, its positive sides, such as its contribution to trade with legal rules, are elaborated. Its mobility, which constantly shapes society, is made visible.

Consequently, this article examined the compulsory history textbooks in high schools issued by the Ministry of National Education based on migration and found that the personal consequences of this concept were ignored by presenting them with the macro qualifications. The concept was presented with the dominance of the terms "nomad" and "unsettled". These terms were used far from their terminological sense or misapplied. As a result, considering high school history textbooks' qualifications can create awareness of the future that young people will shape. The aims should be to make sense of migration, asylum, and refugees by avoiding xenophobia, making visible the oral history method based on human stories, and making young people feel empathy with the people forced to migrate. Since migration affects the present and the people who live in this time, the concept should be presented with the acceptance and awareness that migration is a phenomenon that will naturally shape our future as much as our present. In this context, updating the book is visible not only the macro characteristics of migration but also the micro, and is expressed by the terms of refugee and asylum seeker with their actual legal statuses without being used interchangeably. Finally, it has been claimed in this study that taking migration and whole concepts related to its place in the formation of a peaceful nation is crucial from the societal point while claiming that Turkey's geographical location has been used as evidence.

Research and Publication Ethics Explanation

In this research; it is stated by the author that it has been prepared with the principles of research and publication ethics.

5. REFERENCES

Ağanoğlu, H. Y. (2001). Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Balkanlar'ın Makûs Talihi. İstanbul: Kum Saati Yayınları.

Bloor, M. & Fiona W. (2006). Keywords in qualitative methods: A vocabulary of research concepts. Londra and New Delhi: Sage.

Castles, S. & Miller, M. J. (2008). Göçler çağı. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Erbaş, H. (2018). Göçmen krizi mi? krizlerin göçmenleri mi?: Göçler çağında göçmenlik halleri, çelişkiler ve sorunlar, Durusoy, S. ve Selçuk, I. Ş. (Ed.). Bugünkü Küreselleşmeyi Anlamak, Ankara: İmaj, 123-165.

Erbaş, M. (2010). Zorunlu göç, etkinlik ve kentlilik. Ankara: Palme Yayıncılık.

Erdoğan, M. M. (2020). Suriyeliler Barometresi 2019, Suriyelilerle Uyum İçinde Yaşamın Çerçevesi. Ankara: Orion Kitabevi.

Erdoğan, M. M., & Kaya, A. (Ed.). (2005). Türkiye'nin göç tarihi 14. yüzyıldan 21. yüzyıla Türkiye'ye göçler. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Eren, V. & Çakran, Ş. (2017). Mülteci politikası: Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye karşılaştırması. Mustafa Kemal Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 14 (39), 1-30.

Esendemir, N.& Ertaş, N. (2018). Ortaokul Türkçe ders kitaplarındaki göç olgusuna dair unsurlar. Kuram ve Uygulamada Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi 2, 72-80.

Frankel, J. R. & Wallen, N. E. (2009). How to design and evaluate research in education (7th edition). Boston: McGraw-Hill.

Gencer, T. (2017). Göç ve eğitim ilişkisi üzerine bir değerlendirme: Suriyeli çocukların eğitim gereksinimi ve okullaşma süreçlerinde karşılaştıkları güçlükler. Journal of International Social Research. 10, 838-851.

Güleryüz, A. N. (2015). Geçmişten günümüze Anadolu'ya Yahudi göçü, Türkiye'nin göç tarihi. 14. yüzyıldan 21. yüzyıla Türkiye'ye göçler (Derleyenler: M. Murat Erdoğan, Ayhan Kaya). İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 49-73.

Harari, Y. N. (2015). Sapiens: hayvanlardan tanrılara insan türünün kısa bir tarihi (Ertuğrul Genç, Çev.). İstanbul: Kolektif Yayınları.

IOM (2009). Uluslararası göç hukuku göç terimleri sözlüğü. Cenevre: IOM, Yayın No: 18.

Işık, O., Pınarcıoğlu M. M. (2018). Nöbetleşe yoksulluk: sultanbeyli örneği. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

İçduygu, A., Erder, S., & Gençkaya, Ö. F. (2014). Türkiye'nin uluslararası göç politikaları, 1923-2023: ulus-devlet oluşumundan ulus-ötesi dönüşümlere. İstanbul: Koç Üniversitesi Göç Araştırmaları Merkezi.

Karataş, Z. (2015). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. Manevi Temelli Sosyal Hizmet Araştırmaları Dergisi, 1(1), 62-80.

Karpat, K. (2003). Osmanlı nüfusu (1830-1914): Demografik ve sosyal özellikleri. İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı Yayınları.

Karpat, K. (2015). Önsöz, Türkiye'nin göç tarihi, 14. yüzyıldan 21. yüzyıla Türkiye'ye göçler, (Derleyenler: M.Murat Erdoğan, Ayhan Kaya). İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları 507, XXIII-XL.

Kayapınar, L. & Ayönü, Y. (2015). 14. ve 15. yüzyıllarda Anadolu'ya ve Balkanlar'a Türklerin göçü, Türkiye'nin göç tarihi, 14. yüzyıldan 21. yüzyıla Türkiye'ye göçler, (Derleyenler: M.Murat Erdoğan, Ayhan Kaya)). İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları 507, XXIII-XL.

Kılıç, A. (2016). İspanyol engizisyonu ve Müslümanlar. İnsan ve Toplum, 6(1), 85-117.

Koçak, A, Arun, Ö. (2013). İçerik Analizi Çalışmalarında Örneklem Sorunu. Selçuk İletişim, 4 (3), 21-28.

Laçin, A. vd. (2018). 11. Sınıf Tarih Ders Kitabı. Ankara: MoNE Devlet Kitapları.

Latif, D. (2002). Refugee of the Turkish Republic. The Turkish Yearbook of International Relations, XXXIII, 1-29.

Özcan, K. (2005), Anadolu'da Selçuklu Dönemi Yerleşme Sistemi ve Kent Modelleri, Basılmamış Doktora Tezi, Selçuk Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü Yayınları, Konya.

Sezer, A. & Şanlı, C. (2017). Coğrafya öğretim programında ve ders kitaplarında göç olgusu. Marmara Coğrafya Dergisi, 16-25.

Sezer, A., & İnesi, M. A. (2016). Ortaokul Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarında "Göç". Uluslararası Akademik Araştırmalar Kongresi'nde sunulmuştur. Antalya, Türkiye.

Siyaset, Toplum ve Ekonomi Araştırmaları Vakfı ve TheirWorld. (2017). Breaking the bariers: Getting Syrian children into school in Turkey. Ankara: SETA ve TheirWorld.

MoNE. (2018a). 9^{th} Grade History Textbook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

MoNE. (2018b). 10th Grade History Textbook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

MoNE. (2018c). 11th Grade History Textbook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

MoNE. (2019a). 9th Grade History Textbook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

MoNE. (2019b). 10th Grade History Textbook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

MoNE. (2019c). 11th Grade History Textbook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

MoNE. (2019d). 12th Grade Turkish Revolution History and Kemalism Coursebook. Ankara, Turkey: Board of Education.

Taşkın, A., Memişoğlu, H. (2019). Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarında Güncel Konulara Yer Verilme Durumunun İncelenmesi. Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi. 27. 599-610.

TBMM (2020). Retreived from https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/tutanaklar/TUTANAK/KM_/d00/c002/km_00002024ss0053

UNESCO (2019). Küresel Eğitim İzleme Raporu. Retreived From https://www.raporlar.org/kuresel-egitim-izleme-raporu-2019-unesco/

UNHCR (2020). Türkiye istatistikleri. Retreived from https://www.unhcr.org/tr/unhcr-turkiye-istatistikleri

UNICEF (2018). Child-Refugees-Fast-Facts Retreived from https://www.unicef.nl/files/Child-Refugees-Fast-Facts

UNICEF(2016). Köklerinden Koparılanlar Mülteci ve Göçmen Çocukların Maruz Kaldığı Giderek Büyüyen Kriz Raporu. Retreived from https://www.unicef.org/turkey/media/2291/file/TURmedia Uprooted-ES-Turkish.pdf%20.

Yakut, K., (2015). Kırım Tatarları ve Nogayların Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'na Göçleri (1783-1922). Türkiye'nin Göç Tarihi, 14. Yüzyıldan 21. Yüzyıla Türkiye'ye Göçler, (Derleyenler: M. Murat Erdoğan, Ayhan Kaya), İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları 507, 118-132.

Yazıcı, H., & Demirel, M. (2010). 93 harbi (1877-1878 Osmanlı-Rus savaşı)'nden sonra Eskişehir'e yerleştirilen göçmenler. Atatürk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi 12: 267-278.

Yeniçeri, Y. (2011). 5., 6., 7. ve 8. sınıf Türkçe ders kitaplarında göç olgusu. III. Uluslararası Çocuk ve Gençlik Edebiyatı Sempozyumu in (171). Ankara.

Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2003). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. Ankara: Seçkin Yayınları.